

Key Details: What Each One Points At

Duck! Rabbit! - Grade K - Short lesson

TIME

OBJECTIVE

PRODUCT

15 minutes List everything the two voices offer as proof, and explain why none of it settles the argument.

Essential question: A bill, some bread, a sound, a pair of binoculars. Why does none of it work?

Materials	Text to mark
• The book	• Passage 3 - the bill and the ears
• One proof sheet each	• Passage 4 - the bread and the carrot

- Prepared passages: Passage 3, Passage 4, Passage 5, Passage 9

Lesson sequence

1 Launch - 3 min

- Passage 5 - what they say they heard
- Passage 9 - through the binoculars

Focus:	Proof that proves nothing
Teacher direction:	Each voice keeps pointing at something to prove it is right. Does any of it work?
Prepared text:	Passage 3 2 Teacher model - 5 min
Teacher model:	I read the page about the front of the animal. One voice points and calls it a bill. The other says those are ears. They are pointing at the very same part of the drawing, and both of them are describing it correctly.
Prepared text:	Passage 3 3 Everything they point at - 7 min
Focus:	Four kinds of proof, none of them deciding

Teacher direction:	Using Passages 3, 4, 5 and 9, list the things each voice offers as proof.
Expected answer:	A part of the body: a bill, or a pair of ears. Food: bread, or a carrot. A sound: duck sounds, or rabbit sounds heard distinctly. And an instrument: look through my binoculars, answered with sorry, still a rabbit. Each piece of proof is real - the shape is there, the food is on the page, they each say what they heard - and not one of them makes the other change its mind. The binoculars are the strongest and the least use, because they only make the same shape bigger.
Student product:	A four-row proof sheet: what one offers, what the other says
Prepared text:	Passage 3, Passage 4, Passage 5, Passage 9

Support & extension

Above: Both voices can see the picture perfectly well. Explain what they actually disagree about.

Below: Four rows of proof, then the question at the bottom.

Assessment

- Names one thing a voice points at
- Gives the other voice's answer to it
- Lists two different kinds of proof they use
- Says what happens when the binoculars come out
- Explains why the proof does not settle the argument