

The Book Says, The Second Text Says A Platypus, Probably - Grade 1 - One-sitting lesson

TIME

OBJECTIVE

PRODUCT

30 minutes Compare two informational sources about the platypus and distinguish shared facts, differently worded facts, and source-only details. A completed comparison chart plus one spoken response using one fact from each source. Essential question: Do the book and the second text tell the same platypus?

Materials

- The book
- Probably Chart
- Teacher-read Second Text Card Text to mark
- Book chart rows - bill, feet, fur, eggs, milk
- Second Text Card - teacher-read comparison text

Prepared text A platypus is a mammal with webbed feet, a bill, fur, and an unusual way of finding food underwater. Its bill can detect tiny electrical signals made by other animals. Platypuses lay eggs. Mothers feed their young milk, but they do not have nipples; the milk comes through the skin and collects on the fur. Male platypuses also have a venomous spur on the hind leg.

Lesson sequence

1 Rows aloud - 5 min Read the five existing book-chart rows aloud before introducing the second text. 2 Read the second text - 7 min Read the Second Text Card straight through once. On the second reading, students signal whenever they hear a fact that connects to a chart row. 3 The second text too? - 8 min Mark each row: says it too, says it differently, or book only. Compare the meaning, not just the wording. 4 One from each - 6 min Students prepare a spoken answer using one accurate fact from the book and one from the Second Text Card. 5 Say it at the door - 4 min A few students answer aloud and end with the title's "probably."

Teacher key

Bill: same core fact, different wording about electrical sensing. Feet: both mention webbed feet, but the book gives more locomotion detail. Fur: second text names fur but not the full warmth function. Eggs: both say platypuses lay eggs. Milk: same core fact, different wording. Second-text-only example: the male's venomous hind-leg spur. Support & extension

Support:

Model the bill row and let students choose among “says it too / differently / book only” for the remaining rows. Extension: Identify one second-text-only fact and one book-only detail, then explain why two texts on the same animal may select different information.

Assessment

- Compares meaning rather than wording alone
- Correctly marks at least three chart rows
- Uses one accurate fact from each source
- Names or points to the source of each fact

The Book Says, The Second Text Says

A Platypus, Probably - Grade 1 - One-sitting lesson

TIME	OBJECTIVE	PRODUCT
30 minutes	Compare two informational sources about the platypus and distinguish shared facts, differently worded facts, and source-only details.	A completed comparison chart plus one spoken response using one fact from each source.

Essential question: Do the book and the second text tell the same platypus?

Materials

- The book
- Probably Chart
- Teacher-read Second Text Card

Text to mark

- Book chart rows - bill, feet, fur, eggs, milk
- Second Text Card - teacher-read comparison text

Prepared text

A platypus is a mammal with webbed feet, a bill, fur, and an unusual way of finding food underwater. Its bill can detect tiny electrical signals made by other animals. Platypuses lay eggs. Mothers feed their young milk, but they do not have nipples; the milk comes through the skin and collects on the fur. Male platypuses also have a venomous spur on the hind leg.

Lesson sequence

1 Rows aloud - 5 min

Read the five existing book-chart rows aloud before introducing the second text.

2 Read the second text - 7 min

Read the Second Text Card straight through once. On the second reading, students signal whenever they hear a fact that connects to a chart row.

3 The second text too? - 8 min

Mark each row: says it too, says it differently, or book only. Compare the meaning, not just the wording.

4 One from each - 6 min

Students prepare a spoken answer using one accurate fact from the book and one from the Second Text Card.

5 Say it at the door - 4 min

A few students answer aloud and end with the title's "probably."

Teacher key

Bill: same core fact, different wording about electrical sensing. Feet: both mention webbed feet, but the book gives more locomotion detail. Fur: second text names fur but not the full warmth function. Eggs: both say platypuses lay eggs. Milk: same core fact, different wording. Second-text-only example: the male's venomous hind-leg spur.

Support & extension

Support: Model the bill row and let students choose among "says it too / differently / book only" for the remaining rows.

Extension: Identify one second-text-only fact and one book-only detail, then explain why two texts on the same animal may select different information.

Assessment

- Compares meaning rather than wording alone
- Correctly marks at least three chart rows
- Uses one accurate fact from each source
- Names or points to the source of each fact