

Talk Circle: Does Hanaleah Need to Know?

A Snowman in Jerusalem - Grade 1 - Short lesson

TIME

OBJECTIVE

PRODUCT

8 minutes Participate in a text-based discussion about secrecy, honesty, and kindness using evidence from the ending. One supported discussion turn plus one response to another speaker. Essential question: Is it okay that Pnina decides Hanaleah does not need to know there was not enough snow for a snowman?

Materials

- The book
- Discussion starter card
- Paper and pencil Text to mark
- Pnina's honesty rule - "my Abba never lies" / she cannot tell a lie
- Hanaleah scene - calls the idea Meshugah and says there is no snow
- Ending - Pnina withholds the detail that there was not enough snow for a snowman

Lesson sequence

1 Set the norms - 2 min Set three rules: one voice at a time, every claim points to the book, and each new speaker responds to the previous speaker before adding a reason. 2 Read the collision - 2 min Review the three facts: Pnina values honesty, Hanaleah rejected the snow idea, and the ending withholds one detail. 3 The circle - 4 min Run the question. Students choose a position, cite one of the three facts, and respond to a classmate before the group rereads the final line.

Teacher key

Both "okay" and "not okay" positions can be defended. Strong responses connect the final choice to Pnina's honesty rule, Hanaleah's earlier disbelief, or the intention behind the withheld detail. Support & extension

Support:

Use the frame: "I think the secret is okay/not okay because the book says ____." Extension: Switch sides and answer the harder question: what should Pnina say if Hanaleah asks directly?

Assessment

- States a clear position
- Uses a specific book detail

- Responds to another speaker
- Keeps the discussion focused on the text rather than a general rule alone

Talk Circle: Does Hanaleah Need to Know?

A Snowman in Jerusalem - Grade 1 - Short lesson

TIME

8 minutes

OBJECTIVE

Participate in a text-based discussion about secrecy, honesty, and kindness using evidence from the ending.

PRODUCT

One supported discussion turn plus one response to another speaker.

Essential question: Is it okay that Pnina decides Hanaleah does not need to know there was not enough snow for a snowman?

Materials

- The book
- Discussion starter card
- Paper and pencil

Text to mark

- Pnina's honesty rule - "my Abba never lies" / she cannot tell a lie
- Hanaleah scene - calls the idea Meshugah and says there is no snow
- Ending - Pnina withholds the detail that there was not enough snow for a snowman

Lesson sequence

1 Set the norms - 2 min

Set three rules: one voice at a time, every claim points to the book, and each new speaker responds to the previous speaker before adding a reason.

2 Read the collision - 2 min

Review the three facts: Pnina values honesty, Hanaleah rejected the snow idea, and the ending withholds one detail.

3 The circle - 4 min

Run the question. Students choose a position, cite one of the three facts, and respond to a classmate before the group rereads the final line.

Teacher key

Both "okay" and "not okay" positions can be defended. Strong responses connect the final choice to Pnina's honesty rule, Hanaleah's earlier disbelief, or the intention behind the withheld detail.

Support & extension

Support: Use the frame: "I think the secret is okay/not okay because the book says ____."

Extension: Switch sides and answer the harder question: what should Pnina say if Hanaleah asks directly?

Assessment

- States a clear position
- Uses a specific book detail
- Responds to another speaker
- Keeps the discussion focused on the text rather than a general rule alone