

Who Has Been Opening the Doors

TIME	30 minutes full · 15 minutes short
PRIMARY SKILL	Build an inference from a repeated pattern of clues
OBJECTIVE	Track the same clue across repeated events, distinguish the pattern from any single clue, and use the pattern to explain how the mystery is resolved.
STUDENT EVIDENCE	A three-row clue record, the pattern those clues form, and a final inference supported by that pattern.
ESSENTIAL QUESTION	When several clues repeat, how do they become stronger evidence together than one clue alone?

Before teaching

Read or play the complete book before the timed lesson. Keep the book available so claims and evidence can be checked against the text. Book-specific targets: Track the three door/escape moments and the cat's location at each one.

Materials:	the book, Student Evidence page, pencil.
------------	--

Lesson sequence

TIME	TEACHING MOVE
4 min	Collect the repeated clue Record the first relevant door/escape moment without explaining it yet.
6 min	Add the second and third clues Keep the observations separate so the pattern can be seen rather than announced.
7 min	Name the pattern State what repeats across the clues and what changes.
8 min	Build the inference Use the pattern to explain what is most likely happening.
5 min	Check against the resolution Compare the inference with the book and identify which clue became strongest in hindsight.

Who Has Been Opening the Doors

Access routes

SOLO	Use the book independently to complete the evidence page. Require book-based support for the reasoning.
SUPPORTED	Pause at the key evidence moments. Rephrase the task orally, then have students point to or record evidence before explaining.
LISTENING	Use narration and illustrations. Ask the same book-specific questions orally and accept pointing, choosing between evidence already visible in the book, drawing, or an oral explanation. Do not require teacher-invented answer choices.
EXTEND	Apply the same reasoning move to a second moment in the book or ask students to explain why a tempting alternative is weaker.

Teacher guidance

Keep the lesson on pattern -> inference. Do not let students jump straight to the answer from memory; the product is the visible chain of clues that makes the answer reasonable.

Book-specific answer anchors

- The repeated evidence is the same kind of escape event occurring with an open door while the cat is connected to those moments.
- The supported inference is that the cat is opening the doors and enabling Bagels to escape; the later solution confirms that pattern.
- A single open door is one clue. Several open-door/cat moments form the pattern. 'Cats do things like that' is a guess, not textual evidence.

Assessment

- At least three observations are recorded before the inference.
- The student states a pattern, not merely three disconnected facts.
- The final inference is tied explicitly to the pattern and checked against the book.

Short route · 15 minutes

3 min - name/model the skill. 8 min - gather the minimum evidence required on the student page. 4 min - explain the answer and verify it against the book.

Watch for

Naming the culprit or solution correctly but being unable to show the repeated clues that support it.

Source note

Extracted and audited as a standalone from the ELA unit Using the Evidence. No regional standards are attached to this standalone skill lesson.

STUDENT EVIDENCE · GRADES 2-3

Bagels Come Home

Who Has Been Opening the Doors

Name _____ Date _____ A three-row clue record, the pattern those clues form, and a final inference supported by that pattern.

CLUE 1

CLUE 2

CLUE 3

PATTERN

FINAL INFERENCE

EXIT CHECK

When several clues repeat, how do they become stronger evidence together than one clue alone?

TEACHER KEY · GRADES 2-3

Bagels Come Home

Who Has Been Opening the Doors

Book-specific answer anchors

- The repeated evidence is the same kind of escape event occurring with an open door while the cat is connected to those moments.
- The supported inference is that the cat is opening the doors and enabling Bagels to escape; the later solution confirms that pattern.
- A single open door is one clue. Several open-door/cat moments form the pattern. 'Cats do things like that' is a guess, not textual evidence.

Expected student evidence

- At least three observations are recorded before the inference.
- The student states a pattern, not merely three disconnected facts.
- The final inference is tied explicitly to the pattern and checked against the book.

Watch for

Naming the culprit or solution correctly but being unable to show the repeated clues that support it.

Independent success

The student completes the required evidence product, uses the named book-specific evidence above, and can explain the reasoning move without relying only on recall or a teacher-supplied answer.

Unit source

Using the Evidence · Bagels Come Home by Joan Betty Stuchner