

Clever Beatrice

When the Evidence Leaves It Open

TIME

PRIMARY SKILL

OBJECTIVE

STUDENT EVIDENCE

ESSENTIAL QUESTION

30 minutes full · 15 minutes short Recognize when evidence supports more than one interpretation Give two evidence-based answers to an open question and identify what missing evidence would settle it.

Two supported interpretations, evidence for each, and one statement of what the text would need to add to decide between them.

What should a reader do when the text supports two answers and does not settle the question?

Before teaching

Read or play the complete book before the timed lesson. Keep the book available so claims and evidence can be checked against the text.

Materials:	the book, Student Evidence page, pencil.
-------------------	--

Lesson sequence

TIME	TEACHING MOVE
4 min	Name the open question State the question the text leaves unsettled.
8 min	Build answer A Give one plausible answer and point to evidence that supports it.
8 min	Build answer B Give a different plausible answer and point to evidence that supports it.
6 min	Compare support Explain why neither answer can simply erase the other.
4 min	Name the missing evidence Say what the book would have to tell us to settle the question.

ELA SKILL LESSON · TEACHER SUPPORT

Clever Beatrice

When the Evidence Leaves It Open

Access routes

SOLO	Use the book independently to complete the evidence page. Require page-based support for the central claim.
SUPPORTED	Pause at the key evidence moments. Rephrase the task orally, then have students point to or record the evidence before explaining it.
LISTENING	Use narration and illustrations. Let students respond orally or by selecting from teacher-read options, then ask them to justify the choice from the book.

EXTEND

Ask students to test the skill on a second moment or explain why a tempting alternative answer is weaker.

Teacher guidance

Keep the lesson on recognize when evidence supports more than one interpretation. The source unit places this move inside What it is mainly about; this standalone version should still require evidence from the named book rather than general knowledge or memory.

Assessment

- Both interpretations must have evidence.
- The achievement is naming the gap in evidence, not choosing a favorite side.
- A strong answer identifies a specific kind of missing information that would settle the question.

Short route · 15 minutes 3 min - name/model the skill. 8 min - gather the minimum evidence required on the student page. 4 min - explain the answer and verify it against the book.

Watch for

Treating uncertainty as failure and choosing one side without addressing the competing evidence.

Source note

Extracted from the TumbleTA unit What it is mainly about, using its stated day focus, product, checkpoints, and/or strong-answer criteria. No regional standard is attached to this base skill lesson.

STUDENT EVIDENCE · GRADE 3

Clever Beatrice

When the Evidence Leaves It Open

Name _____ Date _____ Give two possible answers. Support both. Then say what missing evidence would settle the question.

PART**YOUR EVIDENCE****ANSWER A****EVIDENCE A****ANSWER B****EVIDENCE B****WHAT WOULD SETTLE IT****EXIT CHECK**

I should not force one answer because _____

TEACHER KEY · GRADE 3

Clever Beatrice

When the Evidence Leaves It Open

Strong response

Two supported interpretations, evidence for each, and one statement of what the text would need to add to decide between them.

Expected evidence

- Both interpretations must have evidence.
- The achievement is naming the gap in evidence, not choosing a favorite side.

- A strong answer identifies a specific kind of missing information that would settle the question.

Watch for

Treating uncertainty as failure and choosing one side without addressing the competing evidence.

Independent success

The student completes the required evidence product and can explain how the evidence supports the skill claim without relying only on recall or a teacher-supplied answer.

Unit source

What it is mainly about · Clever Beatrice by Margaret Willey