

A Study in Scarlet

Arthur Conan Doyle

What makes Holmes's Afghanistan deduction feel impossible before he explains it and ordinary after he does?

TOTAL TIME

PASSAGE

30 minutes	Holmes reconstructs Afghanistan
------------	---------------------------------

FIND THE ANCHOR TEXT

Use the Anchor Text Table of Contents in the Enhanced Reader to open the START anchor. Then use the dropdown to select the END anchor.

SECTION / LOCATION	Part I, Chapter II · The Science of Deduction
START	Nothing of the sort. I knew you came from Afghanistan.
END	I then remarked that you came from Afghanistan, and you were astonished.
PASSAGE ID	sec-ss-01

THE MOVE

Make invisible reasoning visible by unpacking intermediate steps

WHY THIS PASSAGE

Holmes's Afghanistan deduction seems supernatural because Watson initially sees only the final answer. Once Holmes reconstructs the intermediate observations and links them one by one, the mystery becomes a chain of ordinary inferences.

MARK

Number each observation Holmes says he made about Watson. Draw arrows from each observation to the inference it supports. Box the final step that produces 'Afghanistan.'

NOTICE

- Which step in the chain would be invisible if Holmes gave only the conclusion?
- How many small inferences have to be correct before the final answer works?
- Why does explaining the process make Holmes seem more rational without making the deduction less impressive?

THINK

Answer provisionally: What makes Holmes's Afghanistan deduction feel impossible before he explains it and ordinary after he does? Choose the strongest interpretation you can defend from this passage alone.

WRITE

Write a short evidence-based response to: What makes Holmes's Afghanistan deduction feel impossible before he explains it and ordinary after he does? Use at least two details from the assigned passage and explain how they support your interpretation.

CLOSE

Name the single detail that most changed or sharpened your interpretation, and explain why.

STRONG ANSWER	The deduction feels impossible when only the final answer is visible. Once Holmes reconstructs each observation and inference, the process becomes a chain of ordinary steps rather than magic.
EVIDENCE	Trace at least three intermediate observations from Watson's appearance to Afghanistan and explain how each supports the next.
WATCH FOR	Do not summarize the final deduction only. The lesson is about exposing the hidden chain between evidence and conclusion.
SOLO	Read the exact passage independently.
SUPPORTED	Use narration and sentence highlighting while reading the same passage.
LISTENING	Listen to the exact passage; visual following is optional. Same question and evidence demand.

A Study in Scarlet

Arthur Conan Doyle

What makes Holmes's Afghanistan deduction feel impossible before he explains it and ordinary after he does?

START ANCHOR	Nothing of the sort. I knew you came from Afghanistan.
END ANCHOR	I then remarked that you came from Afghanistan, and you were astonished.

Use the Anchor Text Table of Contents in the Enhanced Reader to open the START anchor. Then use the dropdown to select the END anchor.

OPEN THE MARKED PASSAGE IN TUMBLELIT

SOLO: read independently. SUPPORTED: use narration + highlighting. LISTENING: listen to the exact passage. The question and evidence task stay the same.

1. MARK - Number each observation Holmes says he made about Watson. Draw arrows from each observation to the inference it supports. Box the final step that produces 'Afghanistan.'
2. NOTICE - Which step in the chain would be invisible if Holmes gave only the conclusion? How many small inferences have to be correct before the final answer works? Why does explaining the process make Holmes seem more rational without making the deduction less impressive?
3. THINK - Answer provisionally: What makes Holmes's Afghanistan deduction feel impossible before he explains it and ordinary after he does?
4. WRITE - Write a short response using at least two pieces of evidence from this passage.

Use evidence from the assigned passage. Show what you noticed and how the text supports your interpretation.