

Worship the Spirit of Criticism

Louis Pasteur

Why does Pasteur present criticism as a discipline researchers must direct at their own ideas?

TOTAL TIME	TUMBLETA PASSAGE LOCATION
30 minutes	Address at the Pasteur Institute - advice to young researchers

TEACHER SETUP

Open the work in the Enhanced Reader and cue the span using the START and END anchors below.

START	Keep your early enthusiasm, dear collaborators, but let it ever be regulated by rigorous examinations and tests.
END	only to proclaim your discovery after having exhausted all contrary hypotheses.
PASSAGE ID	sec-pasteur-01

THE MOVE

Trace how an argument turns a value into a concrete intellectual practice

WHY THIS PASSAGE

Pasteur does not praise criticism as negativity. He defines it through behaviors: test claims rigorously, seek decisive proof, resist the desire to publish, and try to destroy one’s own favored explanation. The passage makes skepticism a form of responsibility.

MARK

Underline each action Pasteur asks researchers to perform. Circle the temptation or emotion that makes those actions difficult. Box the phrase about contrary hypotheses.

NOTICE

- What does Pasteur want enthusiasm to be regulated by?
- Why is criticism hardest when a researcher believes the discovery is important?

- What would it mean to try to “ruin” your own experiment?

THINK

Answer provisionally: Why does Pasteur present criticism as a discipline researchers must direct at their own ideas? Choose the strongest interpretation you can defend from this passage alone.

WRITE

Write a short evidence-based response. Use at least two details from the assigned passage and explain how they support your interpretation.

CLOSE

Name the single detail that most changed or sharpened your interpretation, and say why.

STRONG ANSWER

Pasteur presents criticism as self-discipline because researchers are most vulnerable when they want their own discovery to be true. The scientist’s responsibility is therefore to attack the preferred explanation with tests and contrary hypotheses before asking others to accept it.

EVIDENCE

Use one instruction about testing and one detail about resisting the urge to publish.

WATCH FOR

Do not equate criticism with attacking other people. Pasteur’s central demand is that researchers challenge their own conclusions first.

SOLO

Read independently.

SUPPORTED

Narration + highlighting.

LISTENING

Listen; same evidence task.

STUDENT PAGE · GRADE 10 · LESSON 307

Worship the Spirit of Criticism

Louis Pasteur

Why does Pasteur present criticism as a discipline researchers must direct at their own ideas?

WORK

Worship the Spirit of Criticism

TUMBLETA PASSAGE LOCATION	Address at the Pasteur Institute - advice to young researchers
PASSAGE ID	sec-pasteur-01

Your teacher will open or cue the work in the Enhanced Reader. Use the location and verbatim anchors below to confirm the assigned span.

START

Keep your early enthusiasm, dear collaborators, but let it ever be regulated by rigorous examinations and tests.

END

only to proclaim your discovery after having exhausted all contrary hypotheses.

READ / LISTEN TO THE ASSIGNED PASSAGE SOLO: read independently. SUPPORTED: use narration and highlighting. LISTENING: listen to the assigned passage. The question and evidence task stay the same.

1. **MARK** Underline each action Pasteur asks researchers to perform. Circle the temptation or emotion that makes those actions difficult. Box the phrase about contrary hypotheses.
2. **NOTICE** What does Pasteur want enthusiasm to be regulated by? Why is criticism hardest when a researcher believes the discovery is important? What would it mean to try to “ruin” your own experiment?
3. **THINK** Answer provisionally: Why does Pasteur present criticism as a discipline researchers must direct at their own ideas?
4. **WRITE** Write a short response using at least two pieces of evidence from this passage.
5. **CLOSE** Name the single detail that most changed or sharpened your interpretation, and say why.