

Plessy v. Ferguson

U.S. Supreme Court

How does Harlan redefine segregation as a problem of citizenship rather than social preference?

TOTAL TIME	TUMBLETA PASSAGE LOCATION
30 minutes	Justice Harlan's dissent - constitutional equality and caste

TEACHER SETUP

Open the work in the Enhanced Reader and cue the span using the START and END anchors below.

START	I am of opinion that the statute of Louisiana is inconsistent with the personal liberty of citizens,
END	anything in the constitution or laws of any state to the contrary notwithstanding.
PASSAGE ID	sec-plessy-harlan-01

THE MOVE

Analyze how a dissent reframes the legal category at stake in order to expose a majority's reasoning.

WHY THIS PASSAGE

Harlan rejects the idea that segregation is merely a social arrangement. He describes state-imposed separation as a legal injury to citizens, connecting the statute to caste, civil rights, and the Constitution's structure.

MARK

Underline references to citizenship or civil rights. Circle words describing what the state is doing through law. Box the passage that connects segregation to legal inferiority.

NOTICE

- What category does Harlan insist the case belongs to?
- Why does he emphasize state power rather than personal prejudice?

- How does the idea of caste sharpen his constitutional objection?

THINK

Answer provisionally: How does Harlan redefine segregation as a problem of citizenship rather than social preference? Choose the strongest interpretation you can defend from this passage alone.

WRITE

Write a short evidence-based response. Use at least two details from the assigned passage and explain how they support your interpretation.

CLOSE

Name the single detail that most changed or sharpened your interpretation, and say why.

STRONG ANSWER

Harlan reframes segregation as government action that assigns legal status by race. Once the issue is citizenship and state power rather than private social preference, enforced separation becomes a constitutional injury, not a neutral custom.

EVIDENCE

Use one reference to citizenship and one description of the state imposing racial classification.

WATCH FOR

Do not rely on later history or *Brown v. Board*. Explain the logic inside Harlan's dissent itself.

SOLO

Read independently.

SUPPORTED

Narration + highlighting.

LISTENING

Listen; same evidence task.

STUDENT PAGE · GRADE 12 · LESSON 338

Plessy v. Ferguson

U.S. Supreme Court

How does Harlan redefine segregation as a problem of citizenship rather than social preference?

WORK

Plessy v. Ferguson

TUMBLETA PASSAGE LOCATION	Justice Harlan's dissent - constitutional equality and caste
PASSAGE ID	sec-plessy-harlan-01

Your teacher will open or cue the work in the Enhanced Reader. Use the location and verbatim anchors below to confirm the assigned span.

START

I am of opinion that the statute of Louisiana is inconsistent with the personal liberty of citizens,

END

anything in the constitution or laws of any state to the contrary notwithstanding.

READ / LISTEN TO THE ASSIGNED PASSAGE SOLO: read independently. SUPPORTED: use narration and highlighting. LISTENING: listen to the assigned passage. The question and evidence task stay the same.

1. MARK Underline references to citizenship or civil rights. Circle words describing what the state is doing through law. Box the passage that connects segregation to legal inferiority.
2. NOTICE What category does Harlan insist the case belongs to? Why does he emphasize state power rather than personal prejudice? How does the idea of caste sharpen his constitutional objection?
3. THINK Answer provisionally: How does Harlan redefine segregation as a problem of citizenship rather than social preference?
4. WRITE Write a short response using at least two pieces of evidence from this passage.
5. CLOSE Name the single detail that most changed or sharpened your interpretation, and say why.